

Review

Constructing C₄ rice - the challenge of new green revolution

Zhang Bianjiang¹ and Jiao Demao^{2*}¹Nanjing Xiaozhuang University, Nanjing 211171 China.²Jiangsu Academy of Agricultural Sciences 84-401, Nanjing 210014, China.

Accepted 11 December, 2019

The new green revolution is looking for a breakthrough in the world. Constructing C₄ rice based on good plant type is a reliable and effective approach to enhance photosynthetic efficiency in leaf. The paper discusses the significance, techniques, physiological characteristics and future research directions of transgenic rice with C₄ gene and makes some suggestions on breeding new cultivars with super-high yield and photosynthetic efficiency in high light intensity and high temperature area of China, especially in Africa.

Key words: Rice, C₄ photosynthesis gene, photosynthesis, physiological breeding.

INTRODUCTION

Because of the application of semi-dwarf gene in the 1960s and heterosis in the 1970s in China, Chinese rice yield process leaped twice, rising 20%, respectively, from the previous level. Nowadays, average efficiency of light use in high-yield varieties is about 1.5%, while theoretically it should reach 3 - 5% (Qiu, 1992). Thus, photosynthetic productions have prodigious potential to be increased. It is obvious that, in the perspective of photosynthesis, yield consists of two components, "source" and "sink." At present, Chinese super-hybrid rice archives high yield mainly because of the increase in sink, for example, by adjusting plant architecture to obtain a maximum number of grains. However, in the major hybrid rice combinations used so far, the panicles are big, but the empty-seed rate is high as well. To further increase yield, the emphasis should logically be shifted to an increase in "source". In previous years, Ku et al. (1999) introduced key enzymes of the maize C₄ pathway to rice and achieved a significant increase in photosynthetic capacity. We developed a new approach to introduce genes for the C₄ enzymes, phosphoenolpyruvate carboxylase (PEPC) and pyruvate Pi dikinase (PPDK), into sterile and restorer lines, respectively, and enhanced photosynthetic efficiency up to 50% in the F₁ by crossing the two lines (Wang et al., 2004). Therefore,

we believe that, to increase the source, we can integrate C₄ photosynthetic pathway into conventional C₃ rice on the current basis of more efficient plant architecture.

GENETIC ENGINEERING OF C₄ ENZYMES IN C₃ PLANT

Since 1960s, it has been a noticeable research topic to attempt to enhance the photosynthetic efficiency of C₃ plants by incorporating C₄ photosynthetic traits into them, but there has been no striking progress for long terms. After that, the hybridization between C₄ and C₃ - C₄ intermediate plants was made in the genus of *Atriplex* and *Flaveria* and it was discovered that photosynthetic characteristic in the hybrids F₁ was similar to that in C₄ plants with C₄ plant as the male parent (Brown, 1986, 1993). However, in Gramineae, the hybrids between C₃ and C₄ plants usually exhibited infertility due to reasons such as irregular chromosome pairing or genetic barriers. Thus, employing conventional breeding methods to incorporate C₄ traits into C₃ crop cannot still bring into effect.

In the nineties of the 20th century, with the rapid development of molecular biological technology, transfer of foreign genes into crops has become increasingly routine, making it possible to introduce the genes encoding C₄ photosynthesis enzyme into C₃ plants. Gehlen et al. (1996) observed that the PEPC gene from

*Corresponding author. E-mail: jiaodm_123@yahoo.com.cn. Tel: +(0)86-25-84437478.

Corynebacterium glutamicum was expressed in potato by transgenic technique, but the activity of PEPC in transgenic potato was only 5 times that in the untransformed potato, not significantly increasing. Using an *Agrobacterium*-mediated transformation system, Ku et al. (1999) firstly successfully introduced the intact gene of maize PEPC, which is the key enzyme in C₄ photosynthetic pathway in maize, into the C₃ crop rice. The transgenic rice plants showed high-level expression of PEPC gene and exhibited reduced O₂ inhibition of photosynthesis, which opened up broad prospects for improving the photosynthetic productivity of crop by genetic engineering. Until now, PEPC from maize (Ku et al., 1999; Ding et al., 2007; Yuan et al., 2007), from sorghum (Zhang et al., 2003) and from *Echinochloa crusgalli* (Zhang et al., 2005), have been successfully introduced into C₃ rice. There are four reports on transgenic plants, which overproduce PPDK derived from higher plants; transgenic *Arabidopsis* (Ishimaru et al., 1997), potato (Ishimaru et al., 1998), rice (Fukayama et al., 2001) overproducing the maize C₄-specific PPDK and transgenic tobacco overproducing PPDK from a CAM plant *Mesembryanthemum crystallinum* (Sheriff et al., 1998). Three sets of transgenic rice plants overproducing the maize C₄- specific isoform (Takeuchi et al., 2000; Tsuchida et al., 2001) and overexpressing sorghum C₄ specific NAD-malic enzyme (NADP-ME) (Chi et al., 2004) and the rice C₃- specific isoform of NADP-ME (Tsuchida et al., 2001) have been reported. Based on this studies, the technology to express the C₄ enzymes at high levels and in the desired locations in the leaves of C₃ species is becoming well established and it is now possible to produce transgenic C₃ plants that express at least a set of key enzymes of the C₄ pathway.

Recently, the International Rice Research Institute invited scientists from various countries to discuss the possibility of constructing C₄ rice in 10 to 15 years to lead a new "Green Revolution" (Dennis, 2006).

PHYSIOLOGICAL CHARACTERISTICS OF TRANSGENIC RICE EXPRESSING C₄ GENES

In the last decade, more attention has been paid to the introduction of C₄ photosynthetic gene into C₃ plants to raise their photosynthetic capacity (Matsuoka et al., 2001). Due to the development of recombinant DNA technology, PEPC (Ku et al., 1999), PPDK (Fukayama et al., 1999), NADP-ME (Tsuchida et al., 2001) and PEPC+PPDK (Ku et al., 2000) transgenic rice plants have been obtained. As shown by the first study of Ku et al. (1999), they obtained transgenic C₃ plants with high level expression of the maize C₄-specific Ppc gene (encode phosphoenolpyruvate carboxylase, PEPCase) and rice plants obtained exogenous PEPC gene from C₄ maize plant enhance photosynthetic capacity by increase of stomatal conductance (Ku et al., 2001). But recent

experimental result (Jiao et al., 2003) showed that there are no relationships between the increase of photosynthetic rates and the enhancement of stomatal conductance of leaves in PEPC transgenic rice. Physiological studies (Zhang and Jiao, 2002) showed that, the transgenic plants transformed with Ppc gene displayed a light saturation rate higher by 55% and a CO₂ compensation point lower by 27%. Also Zhang et al. (2003) introduced sorghum intact C₄-pepc gene, including its promoter, into two Chinese cultivars of rice. Preliminary data from transformed lines showed that the sorghum C₄-pepc gene had been transcribed and translated in rice and that the transgenic rice gained low CO₂ compensation point and high photosynthesis efficiency. These findings were supported by the results of Bandyopadhyay et al. (2007).

Fukayama et al. (2001) introduced the maize intact C₄-ppdk gene, which contained its own promoter and terminator sequences and exon/intron structure, into rice in 2001. The PPDK activity in the leaves of some transgenic lines was greatly increased, in one line reaching 40-folds over that of wild-type plants. In a homozygous line, the PPDK protein accounted for 35% of total leaf-soluble protein or 16% of total leaf nitrogen. In maize and transgenic rice plants carrying the intact maize gene, the maize C₄-ppdk gene was expressed in a similar organ-specific manner. Ku et al. (2001) reported that transgenic rice plants expressing the maize PEPC and pyruvate, orthophosphate dikinase (PPDK) exhibit a higher photosynthetic capacity (up to 35%) than untransformed plants in 2001. However, the reaction of PPDK is freely reversible, depending on concentrations of substrates, activators and inactivators (Burnell and Hatch, 1985). This could be the reason why the overexpression of PPDK does not result in significant effects on carbon metabolism in the leaves.

As pointed out by Ku et al. (1991), the activity of NADP-ME shows negative correlation with the activity of photorespiration. It thus appears that transfer of NADP-ME gene into C₃ plants might be an effective way of lowering photorespiration and improving photosynthetic efficiency of C₃ plants. There are many reports on the successful transfer of photosynthetic enzymes of C₄ plants into C₃ plants and their high level expression in the latter by means of gene engineering techniques (Ku et al., 1999; Takeuchi et al., 2000; Furayama et al., 2001; Zhang et al., 2003). Yet inconsistent results have been obtained in studies aimed at elucidating the underlying physiological mechanisms. Takeuchi et al. (2000) tried to account for some of the physiological characteristics of transgenic rice expressing high level maize NADP-ME in terms of chloroplast development (Takeuchi et al., 2000). A report suggests that NADP-malic enzyme could be detrimental in the development of normal chloroplasts when expressed at high levels (20 - 70 folds increases) in a C₃ plant (Takeuchi et al., 2000). Chi et al. (2004) confirmed the effective expression of sorghum C₄ type

NADP-ME in rice, with the enzyme activity being elevated 1 - 7 folds. However, no appreciable change was demonstrated in carbon assimilation of the transgenic rice though increased photoinhibition was noted under high light intensity. These studies indicate that the efficiency of photosynthesis of C₃ plants can be increased by transformation with C₄-type genes of C₄ plants.

Interestingly, it has been observed that the photosynthetic rate of PPDK transgenic rice with high expression of PPDK enzymes did not significantly increase (Jiao et al., 2002), while the photosynthetic rate decreased with the introduction of the NADP-ME gene (Chi et al., 2004). In a previous study we showed that the photosynthetic rate in transgenic rice expressing both the PEPC and PPDK genes could be greatly increased with the use of adenosine triphosphate (ATP) or ATP promotive substance (Ji et al., 2005; Zhang et al., 2009). In the present study, exogenous ATP ensured the adequate supply of ATP for the C₄ cycle and consequently greater CO₂ fixation occurred and the Pn in transgenic rice expressing both the PEPC and PPDK genes was increased. Further experiment is required to test this hypothesis. Nevertheless, our findings demonstrated that ATP was a key limiting factor for further promotion of the photosynthetic capacity of transgenic rice expressing C₄ genes and construction of C₄-like rice.

Japanese scientists (Fukayama et al., 2000; Taniguchi et al., 2008) did not observe improved photosynthetic characteristics when PEPC transgenic rice was cultivated in greenhouses under the conditions of 26°C and plant PFD of 500 – 600 mol·m⁻²·s⁻¹. In the present study, the plants were cultivated outdoors during the summer in Nanjing, China (temperature 26 – 35°C and PFD 500 – 1400 mol·m⁻²·s⁻¹), thus under different environmental conditions (Zhang et al., 2009). Zhang and Jiao (2002) also showed that PEPC transgenic rice exhibited the characteristics of high photosynthetic capacity, tolerance to photo-oxidation and increased yield. These findings were supported by the results of Bandyopadhyay et al. (2007). Therefore, we contend that transgenic rice expressing C₄ genes should be cultivated and directionally screened under high light intensity and high temperature conditions, which are important technical conditions. Thus this work were carried out valuably in Africa. But the study of nitrogen and water use efficiency on transgenic rice expressing C₄ genes were still blank.

In recent years, what bred cultivars with the high photosynthetic efficiency and grain yield by introducing the C₄ gene into rice have drawn more attention for breeders? A proposal was put forward to promoting super rice yield by introducing C₄ gene from C₄ plant or algae into them (Yuan and Zhao, 2004). In fact, there have been many works on physiological breeding of transgenic rice with C₄ gene in china. It was reported in a series of work that sterile lines (Wang et al., 2004), restore lines (He et al., 2006) and hybrid rice combinations with PEPC gene have been bred in different ecological regions. More importantly, the marker-free transgenic homozygous rice

restorer lines with PEPC and PPDK genes by *Agrobacterium* -mediated transformation using super binary vector were obtained (Yuan et al., 2007). Doubtlessly, it would be an effective approach for super rice with high photosynthetic efficiency and high grain yield.

Astonishingly, some plants can operate either C₄ or C₃ photosynthetic mechanisms. The submerged culms of *Eleocharis vivipara* are C₃, but the emergent culms are C₄ with the Kranz anatomy characteristic of sedges (Ueno, 1998). This represents an inducible system of the C₄ syndrome, surely useful for identifying the gene(s) responsible for the coordinated expression of both the C₄ biochemistry and Kranz leaf anatomy. Aquatic plants in vernal pools such as *Orcuttia* has been shown to have two types of anatomy: the terrestrial leaves are C₄ with Kranz anatomy but submerged leaves have C₄ biochemistry without Kranz anatomy (Laura et al., 2008). The implication is that C₄ photosynthesis is possible without Kranz anatomy but is beneficial only under water. Study of these species will increase knowledge of the natural range of methods of concentrating carbon dioxide and could aid the design of novel C₄ systems.

FUTURE WORK

Integration of high efficiencies of photosynthetic productivity and plant architecture

Since the scientists have successfully approached the goal of increase “source” by crossing genetically engineered PEPC enzyme contained sterile and restore lines, we can apply such a strategy to the “super-hybrid” rice with high efficient and good architecture. That is, to introduce C₄ enzymes into parental lines of “super-hybrid” rice and integrate the two improved traits together.

Further modification of photosynthetic productivity

In our previous work, we found that photosynthetic rate of PPDK transgenic rice is limited on the increment of light intensity. But such limitation can be released by applying extra ATP (Jiao et al., 2007). Therefore, we guess that if we can increase production of ATP through genetic engineering, the photosynthetic productivity should be further increased. In addition, to further increase the photosynthetic productivity, we can also try to re-fix the CO₂ released by respiration by introducing PEPC of CAM plants, dark activated enzyme, into available C₄-enzyme transgenic rice. In this way, the transgenic plants can carry out C₄ photosynthesis day and night.

Genetic modification of leaf anatomy

So far, all C₄ plants found in nature have specific Kranz structure adapted for their metabolic characteristics. So it

is reasonable to hypothesize that genetic modification of leaf anatomy may also be a useful approach to increase photosynthetic productivity. It was found that in tobacco stems, a C₃ plant, as well as the veins of celery stalks, existed photosynthetic cells with C₄ characteristic, which are just like the bundle sheath cells in maize leaves. They could be engaged in this genetic research aspect of constructing C₄ rice. It is worthy of attention that true C₄ structure of leaves is induced at five leaves stage in the leaves of maize. Recent technique advances such as Laser Capture Microdissection enable us to study the regulatory mechanism of cellular differentiation related not only to the leaf anatomy, but also to the metabolic pathways. We believe that such study will lead us finally to build up an anatomic base for the high efficient photosynthetic productivity of transgenic rice with C₄ pathways.

REFERENCES

- Bandyopadhyay A, Datta K, Zhang J(2007).Yang W.,Raychaudhuri S., Miyao M., Dattaa S.K., Enhanced photosynthesis rate in genetically engineered indica riceexpressing pepc gene cloned from maize. *Plant Science*.172:1204–1209
- Brown RH, Bouton JH.(1993).Physiology and genetics of interspecific hybrids between phytosynthetic type. *Annu Rev Plant Physiol Plant Mol Biol*. 44 :435 - 456.
- Brown RH, Bassett CL, Cameron RG. Evans PT, Bouton JH, Black CC, Sternberg LR, Deniro MJ (1986).Photosynthesis of F1 hybrids between C4 and C3-C4 species of Flaveria. *Plant Physiol*.82: 211.
- Chi W, Zhou JS, Zhang F, Wu NH.(2004). Photosynthetic features of transgenic rice expressing Sorghum C₄ type NADP-ME. *Acta Bot. Sin*. 46: 873–882.
- Dennis N(2006). Agricultural research: Consortium aims to supercharge rice photosynthesis. *Science*. 28:313-423
- Ding ZS, Zhao M, Jing YX, Li LB, Kuang TY(2007). Effect of overexpression of maize ppc gene on photosynthesis in transgenic rice plants. *Acta Agron Sin*. 33: 717-722(in Chinese with an English abstract)
- Fukayama H, Agarie S, Nomura M, Tsuchida H, Ku MSB.(1999).High level expression of maize C₄-specific pyruvate, Pi dikinase and its light activation in transgenic rice plants. *Plant Cell Physiol*. 40:s116
- Fukayama H, Tsuchida H, Agarie S, Nomura M, Onodera H, Ono K, Lee BH, Hirose S, Toki S, Ku MSB, Makino A, Matsuoka M, Miyao M (2001). Signicant accumulation of C₄-speciec pyruvate, orthophosphate dikinase in a C3 plant, rice. *Plant Physiol*. 127: 1136-1146.
- Gehlen J,Panstruga R,Smets H, Merkelbach S, Kleines M, Porsch P, Fladung M, Becker I,Rademacher T, Häusler REHirsch HJ(1996). Effects of altered phosphoenolpyruvate carboxylase activities on transgenic C3 plant *Solanum tuberosum*. *Plant Mol. Biol*. 32: 831-848.
- Gonzalez DH, Iglesias, AA, Andeo CS(1984). On the regulation of phosphoenolpyruvate carboxylase activity from maize leaves by Lmalate: Effect of pH, *J. Plant Physiol*.116: 425.
- He LB, Xiang XC, Li JH, Zhong L, Zhang KZ, Li P(2006). Analysis on genetic background and photosynthetic characteristics of the improved Shuhui 881 with maize C₄-type pepc gene. *Chinese J Rice Sci*.20: 31-35 (inChinese with English abstract)
- Imaizumi N, Ku MSB, Ishihara K, Samejima M, Kaneko S, Matsuoka M.(1997). Characterization of the gene for pyruvate, orthophosphate dikinase from rice, a C₃ plant, and a comparison of structure and expression between C₃ and C₄ genes for this protein. *Plant Mol Biol*. 34: 701-716.
- Ishimaru K, Ohkawa Y, Ishige T, Tobias DJ, Ohsugi R(1998) Elevated pyruvate, orthophosphate dikinase (PPDK) activity alters carbon metabolism in C₃ transgenic potatoes with a C₄ maize PPDK gene. *Plant Physiol*. 103: 340-346
- Ji BH, Tan HH, Zhou R, Jiao DM, Shen YG(2005).Promotive effect of low concentrations of NaHSO₃ on photophosphorylation and photosynthesis in phosphoenolpyruvate carboxylase transgenic rice leaves. *Acta Bot Sin*. 47:178-186
- Jiao DM, Hang XQ, Chi W, Kuang TY, Ku MSB(2001).The characteristics of CO₂ assimilation of photosynthesis and chlorophyll fluorescence in transgenic PEPC rice. *Chin Science Bull*.46:414-418.
- Jiao DM, Huang XQ, Li X, Chi W, Kuang TY, Zhang QD, Ku MSB, Chao DG. (2002).Photosynthetic characteristics and tolerance to photo-oxidation of transgenic rice expressing C₄ photo synthesis enzymes. *Photosynthesis Res*. 72:85-93.
- Jiao DM, Kuang TY, Li X, Ge QY, Huang XQ, Hao NB (2003).Physiological characteristics of the primitive CO₂ concentrating mechanism in PEPC transgenic rice. *Sci China C Life Sci* 46, 438-446.
- Jiao DM, Lin LL, Zhang BJ (2007). Performance of transgenic rice expressing C₄ photosynthesis enzyme. *IRRN*.32: 26.
- Ku MSB, Wu J, Dai Z, Scott R A, Chu C, Edwards G E(1991).Photosynthesis and photorespiratory characteristics of *Flaveria* species plant. *Plant Physiol*. 96: 518–528.
- Ku MSB, Sakae Agarie, Mika N. Fukayama H, Tsuchida H, Ono K, Hirose S, Toki S, Miyao M, Matsuoka M(1999). High-level expression of maize phosphoenolpyruvate carboxylase in transgenic rice plants. *Nature Biotechnology*. 17:76.
- Matsuoka M, Furbank RT, Fukayama H, Miyao M(2001).Molecular engineering of C₄ photosynthesis. *Annu Rev Plant Physiol Plant Mol Biol*. 52: 297–314
- Ku MSB, Agarie S, Nomura M, Fukayama H, Tsuchida H,Ono K, Hirose S, Toki S, Miyao M, Matsuoka M (1999). High-level expression of maize phosphoenolpyruvate carboxylase in transgenic rice plants. *Nat Biotechnol*.17:76–80
- Ku MSB, Cho D, Li X, Jiao DM, Pinto M, Miyao M, Matsuoka M(2001).Introduction of genes encoding C₄ photosynthesis enzymes into rice plants: physiological consequences, *Novartis Found Symp*. 236: 100-111.
- Laura M. Boykin, William T. Pockman1, Timothy K. Lowrey(2008).Leaf Anatomy of Orcuttieae (Poaceae: Chloridoideae): More Evidence of C₄ Photosynthesis without Kranz Anatomy. *Madroño*. 55:143-150.
- Qiu GX(1992).The photosynthetic efficiency in plants.*Plant Physiology and Molecular Biology* (ed. Yu SW), Beijing: Science Press.236-243. (in Chinese)
- Rikishi K, Oquro H, Samejima M(1988). C₄-like plants derived from a cross *Atriplex rosea*(C₄) *Atriplex. Putula* (C₃) *Atriplex.rosea*. *Jap J Breed*. 38: 397.
- Sheriff A, Meyer H, Riedel E, Schmitt JM, Lapke C(1998). The influence of plant pyruvate, orthophosphate dikinase on a C₃ plant with respect to the intracellular location of the enzyme. *Plant Science*. 136:43-57.
- Takeuchi Y, Akagi H, Kamasawa N, Osumi M, Honda H(2000). Aberrant chloroplasts in transgenic rice plants expressing a high level of maize NADP-dependent malic enzyme. *Planta* 211: 265-274.
- Taniguchi Y, Ohkawa H, Masumoto C, Fukuda,T, Tamai T, Lee K, Sudoh S, Tsuchida H, Sasaki H, Fukayama H, Miyao M(2008).Overproduction of C₄ photosynthetic enzymes in transgenic rice plants: an approach to introduce the C₄-like photosynthetic pathway into rice. *Journal of Experimental Botany*.59:1799-1809
- Tsuchida H, Tamai T, Agarie S, Nomura M, Onodera H, Toki S, Ku MSB, Matsuoka M, Miyao M(2001). High level expression of C₄-specific NADP-malic enzyme in leaves and impairment of photoautotrophic growth of a C₃ plant, rice. *Plant Cell Physiol*. 42:138-145.
- Ueno O (1998). Induction of Kranz Anatomy and C₄-like Biochemical Characteristics in a Submerged Amphibious Plant by Abscisic Acid. *Plant Cell*. 10:571-584
- Wang DZ, Chi W, Wang SH, Jiao DM, Wu S, Li X, Li CQ, Zhang YH, Luo YC(2004) Characteristics of transgenic rice with C₄ photosynthetic genes and its application in two-line hybrid breeding. *Acta Agron Sin*.30: 248-252. (in Chinese with English abstract)
- Wang DZ, Jiao DM, Wu S, Li X, Li L, Chi W, Wang SH, Li CQ, Luo YC, Wang XF(2002). Breeding for parents of hybrid rice with maize pepc gene. *Sci Agric Sin*. 35: 1165-1170. (in Chinese with English abstract)
- Yuan LP, Zhao BR(2004).Breeding super rice needing the aid of gene

- engineering. scientific technology China 9:26-27. (in Chinese with an English abstract).
- Yuan DY, Duan MJ, Tan YN, Yi ZL, Yuan LP, Xin SW(2007). Generating marker-free transgenic homozygous rice restorer lines with PEPC and PPDK genes by *Agrobacterium* -mediated transformation using super binary vector. *Hybrid Rice*. 22: 57-63 (in Chinese with an English abstract).
- Zhang F, Chi W, Wang Q, Zhang QD, Wu NH(2003). Molecular cloning of C₄-specific Ppc gene of sorghum and its high level expression in transgenic rice. *Chin Sci Bull*. 48: 1835-1840.
- Zhang GF, Zhao M, Ding ZS, Zhang L, Xiao JT(2005). Cloning and characterization of phosphoenolpyruvate carboxylase gene from *Echinochloa crusgalli*. *Acta Agron Sin*. 31:1365-1369 (in Chinese with an English abstract).
- Zhang YH, Jiao DM (2002). Photosynthetic characteristics of PEPC transgenic rice. *IRRN*. 27:2:14-15
- Zhang BJ, Ling LL, Jiao DM(2009). Photosynthetic characteristics and effect of ATP in transgenic rice with phosphoenolpyruvate carboxylase and pyruvate orthosphosphate dikinase genes. *Photosynthetica*. 47:133-136